

## Antagonistic Activity of *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* Isolates Alone or in Combination with Fungicides Against Some Soil Borne Plant Pathogens under Laboratory and Greenhouse Conditions

<sup>1</sup>Haggag, H.E. Karima, <sup>2</sup>I.E. Elshahawy, and <sup>2</sup>H. Abd-El-Khair

<sup>1</sup>Pest Rearing Department, Central Agricultural Pesticides Laboratory,  
Agricultural Research Centre, Dokki, Giza, Egypt

<sup>2</sup>Plant Pathology Department, National Research Centre, Dokki, Giza, Egypt

**Abstract:** Nine bacterial isolates belongs to *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* genera were tested for their antagonistic activity alone or in combination with fungicides against some soil borne plant pathogens under laboratory and greenhouse conditions. Laboratory studies reveal that all bacterial isolates were highly tolerance to all fungicides at 25, 50 and 100 ppm and they were slightly tolerance at 200 and 400 ppm. According to turbidity values estimated as optical density (OD), the reduction in the growth of bacterial isolates caused by each of mancozeb, metalaxyl M + mancozeb, penycycuron, thiophanate-methyl and thiram + tolclofos-methyl, at 25 ppm, were in the range of 5.1 to 35.9, 0.1 to 12.2, 1.6 to 21.1, 4.3 to 34.5 and 1.0 to 51.8%, respectively. *Bacillus pumilus* (Bp<sub>2</sub>, Bp<sub>2</sub> and Bp<sub>3</sub>), *B. subtilis* (Bs<sub>3</sub>), *P. fluorescens* (Pf<sub>2</sub>), Pf<sub>1</sub>, *B. megaterium* (Bm), Bs<sub>2</sub> and Bs<sub>1</sub> isolates was highly tolerance to penycycuron at 25 ppm, which recorded reduction in (OD) estimated as 1.6, 2.4, 4.1, 4.4, 5.2, 7.1, 8.5, 20.5 and 21.1%, respectively. Under laboratory conditions, the tested bacterial isolates in combination with the fungicide penycycuron at 25 ppm were highly reduced the growth of soil borne pathogens than bacterial isolates alone. Isolates of Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bp<sub>3</sub> and Pf<sub>2</sub> reduced the growth of *F. solani* by 30.0, 54.7 and 75.6%, when used alone, while the reduction attained to 55.6, 61.1 and 88.9%, when used in combination with penycycuron at 25 ppm, respectively. Greenhouse studies evaluated the effect of soil infestation with each of Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bp<sub>3</sub> and Pf<sub>2</sub> isolates inocula alone or in combination with the fungicide penycycuron as seed dressing on the incidence of bean damping-off and root rot diseases caused by *F. solani*. Obtained results reveal that application of each of Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bp<sub>3</sub> and Pf<sub>2</sub> isolates in combination with penycycuron is a promising approach for the improvement of bean root rot control, bean growth parameters in terms of shoot and root length (cm), leaves number per plant, fresh and dry weight (g) of plant, as well as reduction of the dose of penycycuron.

**Key words:** *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* Isolates • Antagonistic Activity • Combination with Fungicides and Soil Borne Plant Pathogens

### INTRODUCTION

Control of the plant diseases using chemicals sometimes cause serious ecological problems. In recent years, the increasing use of potentially hazardous pesticides and fungicides in agriculture has been the result of growing concern of both environmentalists and public health authorities. Biocontrol agents can be used for controlling several diseases such as damping-off, root-rot, seed decay, collar rot, crown rot and wilt as well as foliar diseases. Biological control methods are

safe and environmental friendly pesticides alternatives in agriculture application [1]. But biological control alone sometimes un-sufficient to eradicate or reduced the propagules of the pathogens. Therefore integration methods between biocontrol agents and the fungicides could be effective. The tolerance of bacterial biocontrol agents to fungicides was studied by many workers over the world. Malathi *et al.* [2] tested the systemic fungicides *viz.*, thiophanate methyl and carbendazim combined with *Pseudomonas fluorescens* Migula for managing sugarcane red rot disease caused by *Colletotrichum*

*falcatum* Went. They found that the growth of *P. fluorescens* (about 11 strains) was not affected up to 500 ppm of those systemic fungicides viz., thiophanate methyl and carbendazim, according to turbidity values of bacterial growth *in vitro* tests. They added that in pots experiment the treatment receiving thiophanate methyl and *P. fluorescens* recorded the maximum plant survival of 81.67%. *Bacillus subtilis* Chon and *P. fluorescens* also were tolerance to azoxystrobin 23 SC *in vitro* at high concentration of 300 ppm [3]. Also, Devi and Prakasam [4] showed that *B. subtilis* and *P. fluorescens* were tolerance to azoxystrobin 25 SC at the concentrations of 5, 10, 50, 100 and 250 ppm. The tolerance of three isolates of each *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* with common used fungicides in tea plantation such as hexaconazole, carbendazim, mancozeb and copper oxychloride were tested *in vitro* by Pallavi *et al.* [5]. They reported that all the six selected biocontrol isolates showed growth tolerance in carbendazim, followed by hexaconazole. Valarmathi *et al.* [6] reported that *B. subtilis* and *P. fluorescens* were also tolerance to copper hydroxide (Kocide 3000) even at a high concentration of 300 ppm. The tolerance of *B. subtilis* and *P. fluorescens* to carbendazim, mancozeb, metalaxyl, captan, thiram and nemacur, commonly used for the control of soil borne plant pathogens, was studied by Mohiddin and Khan [7]. They found that *P. fluorescens* was more tolerance to fungicides than *B. subtilis* and the maximum tolerance concentration for the former being 2500 µg/ml of thiram, 1600 µg/ml of mancozeb and 50,000 µg/ml for captan and carbendazim.

Bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L.) is one of the most important food legumes for human consumption in the world. Several soil borne fungi attacked bean plants causing damping-off and root rot diseases. These diseases were commonly attributed to *Fusarium solani* (Mart.) Sacc. in complex with *Rhizoctonia solani* and *F. oxysporum* [8-10]. The disease incidence of damping-off and bean root rot has risen with the increased acreage of this crop, the shortening of crop rotation intervals and the use of highly susceptible cultivars. Yield losses in several infested areas approach 50% [11, 10].

The research was conducted (i) to study the inhibitor effect of five commercial fungicides against the growth of both some soil borne fungal pathogens and the nine bacterial isolates belongs to *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* genera *in vitro*; (ii) to evaluate the antagonistic activity of the nine bacterial isolates alone or in combination with fungicides against some soil borne plant pathogens *in vitro* and (iii) to determine the effect of bacterial isolates alone or in combination with the fungicide pencycuron on the incidence of bean damping-off and root rot caused by *F. solani* under greenhouse conditions.

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

**Bacillus and Pseudomonas Isolates:** Nine bacterial isolates viz., three isolates of *B. subtilis* (Bs<sub>1</sub>, Bs<sub>2</sub> and Bs<sub>3</sub>), three isolates of *B. pumilus* Meyer and Gottheil (Bp<sub>1</sub>, Bp<sub>2</sub> and Bp<sub>3</sub>), one isolates of *B. megaterium* de Bary (Bm) and two isolates of *P. fluorescens* (Pf<sub>1</sub> and Pf<sub>2</sub>) used in this study, were isolated from Egyptian soil using serial dilution method [12]. Bacterial isolates were identified in Plant Pathology Department, National Research Centre (NRC) according to their morphological and cultural characteristics as described by Dowson [13] and Lelliott and Stead [14]. Bacterial isolates were stained by Gram staining. Finally, several physiological and biochemical tests were carried out according to Bergey's Manual of Systematic Bacteriology [15].

**Soil Borne Plant Pathogens:** Five soil borne plant pathogens, i.e. *Fusarium oxysporum* Schlecht. Emend. Snyd. Et Hans, *F. solani*, *Rhizoctonia solani* Kühn, *Macrophomina phaseolina* (Tassi.) Goid and *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* (Lib.) de Bary, obtained from Plant Pathology Department, National Research Centre (NRC), were used in this study.

**Fungicides:** Five commercial fungicides viz., mancozeb (Tridex 80%), metalaxyl M + mancozeb (Ridomil Glod 68%), pencycuron (Monceren 25% WP), thiophanate-methyl (Topsin-M 70% WG) and thiram + tolclofos-methyl (Rizolex T 50% WP), were obtained from the Central Agricultural Pesticides Laboratory, Dokki, Giza, Egypt.

### Laboratory Experiments

**Inhibitor Effect of Tested Fungicides Against Some Soil Borne Fungal Pathogens:** Effect of all tested fungicides at the concentrations of 0, 100, 200, 400 and 600 ppm against the radial mycelial growth of *F. solani*, *F. oxysporum*, *R. solani*, *M. phaseolina* and *S. sclerotiorum* were evaluated via the poisoned food technique described by Schmitz [16] and Borum and Sinclair [17]. The experiment was conducted in Completely Randomized Design. The autoclaved potato dextrose agar (PDA) medium was used. Fungicides concentrations were prepared based on their active ingredient and then was added to PDA medium before its solidification to obtain the proposed concentrations of 0, 25, 50, 100, 200 and 400 ppm. About 0.1ml of Tween 80 (Sigma) was mixed gently with medium to enhance solubility. Then, 15 ml of fungicide amended PDA medium was poured in sterilized Petri plates (9 cm-diameter). The amended medium was allowed to solidify. Tween 80 amended PDA medium without fungicide was kept as

control. Then, 0.5 cm fungal mycelial disc of each *F. solani*, *F. oxysporum*, *R. solani*, *M. phaseolina* and *S. sclerotiorum* was picked from 7-days-old purified culture with the help of a sterilized cork borer and then the disc was inoculated in the center of each plate. Four Petri plates were used as replicates for each treatment as well as untreated control. The diameter (cm) of each soil borne fungi growth was measured when the fungal growth of the control plates reached full growth of the Petri plate. The percent inhibition in radial mycelial growth of the pathogenic fungi caused by fungicides over the control was calculated using the formula given by Vincent [18] as follow:

$$\text{Pathogen growth inhibition (\%)} = [(dc-dt)/dc] \times 100$$

where

dc = Average diameter of pathogen growth in control. dt = Average diameter of pathogen growth in fungicide treatment.

**Inhibitor Effect of Tested Fungicides Against the Growth of Bacterial Isolates:** The tolerance of Bs<sub>1</sub>, Bs<sub>2</sub>, Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bp<sub>1</sub>, Bp<sub>2</sub>, Bp<sub>3</sub>, Bm, Pf<sub>1</sub> and Pf<sub>2</sub> isolates to the tested fungicides was evaluated *via* the turbidometric method [19]. The Nutrient Broth medium NB (g/l): peptone 5 g, beef extract 3 g, sodium chloride 5 g, glucose 20 g, pH 7; was dispersed in 50 ml quantities into 250 ml Erlenmeyer flasks and sterilized by autoclaving at 121°C for 15 min. Fungicides concentrations were prepared based on their active ingredients and then added to NB medium to obtain the proposed concentrations of 0, 25, 50, 100, 200 and 400 ppm and mixed gently with 0.1% Tween 80 (Sigma) to enhance solubility. Flasks containing NB medium with 0.1% Tween 80 only was kept as control. Then, one ml of the bacterial suspension (10<sup>7</sup>-10<sup>9</sup> colony forming units (CFU)/ml of bacterial antagonist) grown on NB medium for 48 h was transferred to each flask. Five flasks were used as replicates for each treatment as well as the control. The inoculated flasks were incubated at 28±2°C in a shaker incubator for 48h. At the end of incubation period the optical density values of the culture broth were determined using Unic UV-2000 Spectrophotometer at 610 nm [4]. The percent reduction in bacterial growth of *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* isolates in fungicides treatments was calculated based on the optical density value in the control using the following formula:

$$\text{Bacterial growth reduction (\%)} = [(A-B)/A] \times 100$$

where,

A = Optical density (OD) value in control and B = OD value in fungicide treatment.

**Antagonistic Activity of *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* Isolates Against Some Soil Borne Fungal Pathogens:**

The antagonistic effect of Bs<sub>1</sub>, Bs<sub>2</sub>,Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bp<sub>1</sub>, Bp<sub>2</sub>, Bp<sub>3</sub>, Bm, Pf<sub>1</sub> and Pf<sub>2</sub> isolates against some soil borne plant pathogens were tested *via* the dual culture technique using the method described by Estrella *et al.* [20]. Each bacterial isolate was cultured (by streaking) at 1cm from the edge of a 9-cm diameter Petri plate containing freshly sterilized PDA medium. On the opposed position 1cm away from the other set of the plate a 5-mm plug taken from the leading edge of a 5-days old culture of *Fusarium solani*, *F.oxysporum*, *Rhizoctonia solani*, *Macrophomina phaseolina* and *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum*, was cultured individually. For untreated plates, an agar disc (5-mm in diameter) of pathogenic fungi only was placed at 1cm from the edge of a 9-cm diameter Petri plate containing PDA medium. Five plates were used as replicates for each treatment as well as the control. Inoculated plates were incubated at 25 ± 1°C except for *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* which was incubated at 20±2°C until the fungal growth of the control plates reached full growth of the plate. The reduction in mycelial growth of the pathogenic fungi was calculated using the formula suggested by Pandey *et al.* [21] as follows: R = C – T / C × 100, whereas: R = Mycelial growth reduction (%) of the pathogen, C = Radial growth of the pathogen in control plates (cm) and T = Radial growth of the pathogen in dual culture plate (cm).

**Antagonistic Activity of *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* Isolates in Combination with the Fungicide Pencycuron Against Some Soil Borne Fungal Pathogens:**

The antagonistic effect of Bs<sub>1</sub>, Bs<sub>2</sub>,Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bp<sub>1</sub>, Bp<sub>2</sub>, Bp<sub>3</sub>, Bm, Pf<sub>1</sub> and Pf<sub>2</sub> isolates in combination with the fungicide pencycuron at 25 ppm (the low inhibitor concentration against bacterial isolates), against soil borne plant pathogens, were assessed by poisoned food technique and dual culture technique using PDA medium according to the method described by Bardia and Rai [22]. The prepared PDA medium was dispersed in 200 ml quantities into 250 ml Erlenmeyer flasks and sterilized by autoclaving at 121°C for 15 min. Pencycuron concentration were prepared based on its active ingredients and then added

to PDA medium before its solidification to obtain the concentration of 25 ppm and mixed gently with 0.1% Tween 80 (Sigma) to enhance solubility. Then 15 ml of fungicide amended PDA medium was poured in sterilized 9 cm Petri plates. The amended medium was allowed to solidify. Each bacterial isolate was cultured (by streaking) at 1cm from the edge of fungicide amended Petri plate. On the opposed position 1cm away from the other set of the plate a 5-mm plug from the leading edge of a 5-days old culture of *F. solani*, *F. oxysporum*, *R. solani*, *M. phaseolina* and *S. sclerotiorum*, cultured on PDA medium were inoculated individually. Fungicide amended PDA medium inoculated with the pathogen only served as control. Five plates were used as replicates for each treatment as well as the control. Inoculated plates were incubated at  $25 \pm 1^\circ\text{C}$  except for *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* which was incubated at  $20 \pm 2^\circ\text{C}$  until the fungal growth of the control plates reached full growth. Inhibition of the pathogenic fungal growth (%) was calculated as mentioned before.

**Greenhouse Experiment:** In this experiment the promising treatments of bacterial isolates, fungicide and combination between them in controlling Fusarium damping-off and root rot diseases of bean plants were selected as a model for semi applied test.

**Plant Material:** White bean seeds cv. Giza 4 was obtained from Vegetable Crops Research Department, Agric. Res. Centre, Giza, Egypt.

**Damping-off and Root Rot Pathogen:** Pathogenic isolate of *F. solani*, the causal organism of damping-off and root rot diseases in bean, was obtained from Department of Plant Pathology, NRC. Isolation, purification, identification and pathogenicity test were confirmed in previous study [23]. Fungal mass production used for soil infestation in pots was obtained by growing the tested isolate on sand-barley medium. This natural medium was prepared by mixing sand and barley (100 g ground barley grains mixed with 40 g washed sand and 60 ml distilled water); then the mixture placed in 500-ml glass bottles sealed with cotton plugs were sterilized three times (1 hr each time) at  $121^\circ\text{C}$ . The autoclaved medium was then inoculated with a 5-mm disk obtained from 5-day old culture of *F. solani* and then incubated at  $25 \pm 1^\circ\text{C}$  for two weeks [24].

**Bacterial Isolates:** The bioagent isolates of *B. subtilis* (Bs<sub>2</sub>), *B. pumilus* (Bp<sub>3</sub>) and *P. fluorescens* (Pf<sub>2</sub>) used in the

greenhouse experiment were selected based on their inhibitor effect against soil borne fungal pathogens as well as their high tolerance to the tested fungicides *in vitro*.

**Fungicide:** The fungicide pencycuron (Monceren 25% WP), used in the greenhouse experiment were selected based on its inhibitor effect against soil borne fungal pathogens as well as its low inhibitor effect against bacterial isolates *in vitro*.

**Experimental Trails:** Pots experiment was carried out in the greenhouse of Pest Rearing Department, Central Agricultural Pesticides Laboratory, Agricultural Research Centre, Dokki, Giza, Egypt. The experiment was conducted to evaluate the role of soil application with bacterial biocontrol agents of Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bp<sub>3</sub> and Pf<sub>2</sub>, used alone or in combination with seed dressing with pencycuron, in control *F. solani*, the causal organism of damping-off and root rot diseases of bean. For soil infestation, 120g of *F. solani* inoculum were added to 30cm diameter pots, filled with steam sterilized sandy loamy soil 15 days before cultivation to ensure the distribution of the inocula [11].

For soil treatments, inocula of bacterial isolates were prepared by inoculated one loopful of each of *B. subtilis* (Bs<sub>2</sub>), *B. pumilus* (Bp<sub>3</sub>) and *P. fluorescens* (Pf<sub>2</sub>), into Nutrient Broth medium and incubated on a shaker incubator (125 rpm) at  $28 \pm 1^\circ\text{C}$ . Antagonistic bacterial cells were then harvested after 48 hours of growth in culture medium by centrifugation at 6,000 rpm for 15 min and re-suspended in a phosphate buffer (0.01 M, pH 7.0). The cell suspension was adjusted by plate count technique to an approximately  $10^8$  colony forming unit CFU / ml as mentioned by Mosa *et al.* [25]. Infested pots were treated with the bacterial suspension at a dose of 500ml / pot one week before seed sowing [26]. White bean seeds cultivar Giza 4 was surface sterilized by immersion in a solution of 2.5% NaOCl for 3 min, then rinsed three times in sterile water. Surface sterilized seeds were sown in the pots by the rate of ten seeds per pot.

For seed treatments, the fungicide pencycuron at the rate of 1.0g/kg seeds (= 250 ppm, ten folds of the tested laboratory concentration) were applied to surface sterilized bean seeds moistened with 1% carboxymethyl cellulose in polyethylene bag and then were shaken well. A set of four pots was used for every treatment *viz.*, soil treatments, seed treatments and combined treatments as well as the control (infested pots with *F. solani* only). Treatments included:

- T<sub>1</sub>= *F. solani* only.
- T<sub>2</sub>= *F. solani* + *B. subtilis* (Bs<sub>3</sub>).
- T<sub>3</sub>= *F. solani* + *B. pumilus* (Bp<sub>3</sub>).
- T<sub>4</sub>= *F. solani* + *P. fluorescens* (Pf<sub>2</sub>).
- T<sub>5</sub>= *F. solani* + Pencycuron (Pe).
- T<sub>6</sub>= *F. solani* + Bs<sub>3</sub> + Pe.
- T<sub>7</sub>= *F. solani* + Bp<sub>3</sub> + Pe.
- T<sub>8</sub>= *F. solani* + Pf<sub>2</sub> + Pe.

**Disease Assessment:** Percentages of bean damping-off incidence at pre- and post-emergence stages were calculated after 15 and 30 days, respectively. Thereafter, the percentages of dead plants due to infection by root rot was recorded up to 60 days after sowing [27].

**Plant growth parameters:** Effect of different treatments on the growth parameters of bean plants in terms of shoot and root length (cm), leaves number per plant, fresh and dry weight (g) of plant were recorded after 60 days of seed sowing [23].

**Statistical Analysis:** All experiments were arranged in Complete Randomized Design. All experiment was also repeated twice and the obtained data were analyzed by using least squares analysis of variance (ANOVA), Least Significant Difference (L. S. D.) test was used at the 0.05% level of significance [28].

**RESULTS**

**Laboratory Experiments**

**Inhibitor Effect of Tested Fungicides Against Some Soil Borne Fungal Pathogens:** The inhibitor effect of tested fungicides against the growth of some soil borne plant pathogens at the concentrations of 0.0, 25, 50, 100, 200 and 400 ppm are listed in Table 1. There was a significant differences among pathogenic fungi in their response to the tested fungicides, where the inhibitor efficacy was increased with the increase of fungicide concentrations. The fungicide mancozeb was completely inhibited the growth of *S. sclerotiorum*, while it was not showing any

Table 1: Inhibitor effect of tested fungicides against the growth of some soil borne plant pathogens *in vitro*.

Linear mycelial growth (cm) and growth reduction (%) of pathogenic fungi											
Fungicide	Conc. (ppm)	<i>F. solani</i>		<i>F. oxysporum</i>		<i>R. solani</i>		<i>M. phaseolina</i>		<i>S. sclerotiorum</i>	
		Growth (cm)	Red. (%)	Growth (cm)	Red. (%)	Growth (cm)	Red. (%)	Growth (cm)	Red. (%)	Growth (cm)	Red. (%)
Mancozeb	0.0	9.00	-	9.00	-	9.00	-	9.00	-	9.00	-
	25	9.00	0.0	8.90	1.1	5.32	40.9	9.00	0.0	4.70	47.8
	50	9.00	0.0	8.30	7.8	4.67	48.1	9.00	0.0	2.30	74.4
	100	8.90	1.1	7.67	14.8	3.60	60.0	9.00	0.0	0.00	100.0
	200	7.40	17.8	6.73	25.2	2.97	66.7	9.00	0.0	0.00	100.0
	400	7.20	20.2	4.10	54.4	2.30	74.4	9.00	0.0	0.00	100.0
Metalaxyl M - Mancozeb	0.0	9.00	-	9.00	-	9.00	-	9.00	-	9.00	-
	25	9.00	0.0	9.00	0.0	5.65	37.2	9.00	0.0	4.88	45.8
	50	9.00	0.0	8.80	2.2	3.50	61.1	9.00	0.0	2.44	72.9
	100	8.60	4.4	8.30	7.8	2.63	70.7	9.00	0.0	0.00	100.0
	200	6.27	30.4	6.17	31.5	1.43	83.3	9.00	0.0	0.00	100.0
	400	4.47	41.2	3.50	61.1	0.00	100.0	9.00	0.0	0.00	100.0
Pencycuren	0.0	9.00	-	9.00	-	9.00	-	9.00	-	9.00	-
	25	9.00	0.0	9.00	0.0	8.80	2.2	9.00	0.0	9.00	0.0
	50	9.00	0.0	8.90	1.1	8.12	9.8	9.00	0.0	8.50	5.6
	100	8.60	4.4	8.67	3.7	7.90	12.2	9.00	0.0	7.30	18.9
	200	6.40	28.9	5.90	34.4	3.83	55.6	9.00	0.0	4.30	52.2
	400	5.17	32.0	5.70	36.7	3.57	60.4	9.00	0.0	2.70	70.0
Thiophanate - methyl	0.0	9.00	-	9.00	-	9.00	-	9.00	-	9.00	-
	25	9.00	0.0	8.50	5.6	8.48	5.7	9.00	0.0	9.00	0.0
	50	8.00	11.1	8.00	11.1	7.98	11.9	8.70	3.3	8.50	5.6
	100	7.47	17.1	7.37	18.2	7.30	18.9	7.50	16.7	7.60	15.6
	200	5.00	44.4	4.97	44.8	1.47	83.3	2.60	71.1	4.77	46.7
	400	3.03	60.1	3.50	61.1	1.00	88.9	0.00	100.0	0.00	100.0
Thiram +Tolofos-methyl	0.0	9.00	-	9.00	-	9.00	-	9.00	-	9.00	-
	25	7.00	22.2	8.48	5.8	5.30	41.1	4.00	55.6	4.46	50.4
	50	5.30	41.1	8.10	10.0	4.40	51.1	2.30	75.4	3.30	63.3
	100	4.20	53.3	7.27	19.2	0.00	100.0	1.27	85.6	1.00	88.9
	200	0.80	91.1	1.97	78.2	0.00	100.0	0.00	100.0	0.00	100.0
	400	0.00	100.0	0.00	100.0	0.00	100.0	0.00	100.0	0.00	100.0
L.S.D. 0.05		Fungicide (F)		Pathogen (P)		F x P	Concentration (C)		F x C	P x C	F x P x C
Mycelial growth (cm)		0.04		0.04		0.08	0.05		0.09	0.09	0.18
Mycelial reduction (%)		1.28		1.28		2.56	1.43		2.86	2.86	5.71

inhibitor effect against *M. phaseolina* at all tested concentrations. The growth inhibition of *F. solani*, *F. oxysporum* and *R. solani* caused by mancozeb was in the ranges of 0.0-20.2%, 1.1-54.4% and 40.9-74.4%, respectively. Metalaxyl M + mancozeb was completely inhibited the growth of *S. sclerotiorum* at the high concentrations, viz., 100, 200 and 400ppm, while it was completely inhibited the growth of *M. phaseolina* at all the tested concentrations.

Metalaxyl M + mancozeb was inhibited the growth of *F. solani*, *F. oxysporum* and *R. solani* in the ranges 0.0-41.2%, 0.0-61.1 % and 37.2-100.0%, respectively (Table 1). Pencycuren was completely inhibited the growth of *M. phaseolina* at all tested concentrations. The reduction caused by pencycuren against the growth of *F. solani*, *F. oxysporum*, *R. solani* and *S. sclerotiorum* was in the range of 0.0-32.0%, 0.0 -36.7%, 2.2-60.4% and 0.0-70.0%, at all tested concentrations, respectively. Thiophanate-methyl inhibited the growth of *F. solani*, *F. oxysporum*, *R. solani*, *M. phaseolina* and *S. sclerotiorum* by the range of 0.0-60.1%, 5.6-61.1%, 11.9-88.9%, 0.0-100% and 0.0-100%, at all tested concentrations, respectively. Thiram + tolelofos-methyl was completely inhibited the growth of *F. solani*, *F. oxysporum* at 400 ppm, while the fungicide was completely inhibited the growth of *R. solani*, *M. phaseolina* and *S. sclerotiorum* at 200 and 400 ppm (Table 1).

#### **Inhibitor Effect of Tested Fungicides Against the Growth of Bacterial Isolates**

**Inhibitor Effect of Mancozeb:** The reduction in the growth of the tested bacterial isolates caused by the fungicide mancozeb was in the range of 5.1-77.5% at all tested concentrations. Among the tested bacterial isolates, Bp<sub>3</sub> was highly tolerance to mancozeb at 25 and 50 ppm, which recorded reduction in OD estimated as 5.1 and 6.9 %, respectively. *Bacillus megaterium* (Bm) isolate was also highly tolerance to mancozeb at 25 ppm only, which recorded reduction in OD estimated as 6.9% (Table, 2). Other bacterial isolates were highly tolerance to mancozeb at 25, 50 and 100 ppm and they were slightly tolerance at 200 and 400 ppm.

**Inhibitor Effect of Metalaxyl M + Mancozeb:** The reduction in the growth of the tested bacterial isolates caused by the fungicide metalaxyl M + mancozeb was in the range of 0.1 - 64.0% at all tested concentrations. *Bacillus megaterium* (Bm) isolate was highly tolerance to metalaxyl M + mancozeb at 25, 50 and 100 ppm, which

recorded reduction in OD estimated as 1.1, 4.5 and 8.2 %, respectively. Meanwhile, Bs<sub>1</sub> and Bs<sub>3</sub> isolates was highly tolerance to metalaxyl M + mancozeb at 25 and 50 ppm, which recorded reduction in OD estimated as 2.3 and 9.2 and 4.9 and 7.8%, respectively. Isolates of Bp<sub>3</sub>, Pf<sub>1</sub>, Bs<sub>2</sub>, Bp<sub>2</sub>, Bp<sub>1</sub> and Pf<sub>2</sub> were highly tolerance to metalaxyl M + mancozeb at 25 ppm, which recorded reduction in OD estimated as 2.1, 4.4, 5.8, 9.0, 9.5 and 12.5, respectively (Table, 3). Other bacterial isolates were highly tolerance to metalaxyl M + mancozeb at 25, 50 and 100 ppm and they were slightly tolerance at 200 and 400 ppm.

**Inhibitor Effect of Pencycuron:** The tested bacterial isolates were highly tolerance to pencycuron at 25, 50 and 100 ppm, while it was slightly tolerance at 200 and 400 ppm. The reduction in OD caused by pencycuron was in the range of 1.6 - 63.3 % at all tested concentrations. Isolates of Bp<sub>3</sub>, Bs<sub>3</sub>, Pf<sub>2</sub>, Pf<sub>1</sub>, Bp<sub>3</sub>, Bp<sub>4</sub>, Bm, Bs<sub>2</sub> and Bs<sub>1</sub> were highly tolerance at 25 ppm, which recorded reduction in OD estimated as 1.6, 2.4, 4.1, 4.4, 5.2, 7.1, 8.5, 20.5 and 21.1 %, respectively. Meanwhile, isolates of Bp<sub>3</sub>, Pf<sub>2</sub> and Bs<sub>3</sub> isolates were highly tolerance at 50 ppm, while Bp<sub>3</sub> and Pf<sub>2</sub> isolates were highly tolerance at 100 ppm, which recorded reduction in OD estimated as 3.7, 7.4, 7.4, 7.0 and 9.0%, respectively (Table, 4).

**Inhibitor Effect of Thiophanate-Methyl:** At the concentration of 25 ppm, Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bs<sub>2</sub>, Pf<sub>4</sub>, Bp<sub>3</sub> and Bp<sub>1</sub> isolates was highly tolerance to thiophanate-methyl, where the recorded reduction in OD were 4.3, 6.3, 6.3, 6.7 and 9.4%, respectively. While at 50 ppm, Bp<sub>3</sub> isolate only showed high tolerance, where the reduction in OD were 9.6%. Other bacterial isolates were high tolerance to thiophanate-methyl at 25, 50 and 100 ppm and slightly tolerance at 200 and 400 ppm (Table, 5).

**Inhibitor Effect of Thiram + Tolclofos-Methyl:** The tested bacterial isolates were highly tolerance to thiram + tolclofos-methyl at 25, 50 and 100 ppm and they were slightly tolerance at 200 and 400 ppm. The reduction in OD caused by thiram + tolclofos-methyl was in the range of 1.0-98.5 % at all tested concentrations. At the concentration of 25 ppm, Bs<sub>3</sub>, Pf<sub>2</sub>, Bp<sub>3</sub> and Bp<sub>1</sub> isolates was highly tolerance to, where the reduction in OD were 1.0, 2.0, 5.8 and 6.5%, respectively. Isolates of Bs<sub>3</sub> and Pf<sub>2</sub> was highly tolerance at 50 ppm, which recorded reduction in OD estimated as 2.2 and 6.1%, respectively. Isolate of Pf<sub>1</sub> was highly tolerance to thiram + tolclofos-methyl at 100 ppm, where the reduction in OD was 9.3% (Table, 6).

Table 2: Inhibitor effect of mancozeb against *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* isolates *in vitro*.

Bacterial growth as optical density (OD) and reduction (%)											
-----											
Mancozeb concentrations (ppm)											
-----											
	0.0	25	50	100	200	400					
	OD	OD	Red.	OD	Red.	OD	Red.	OD	Red.	OD	Red.
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>1</sub> )	1.640	1.051	35.9	0.900	45.0	0.813	50.4	0.715	56.4	0.493	70.0
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>2</sub> )	1.773	1.481	16.5	1.071	39.6	0.831	53.1	0.805	54.5	0.705	60.3
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>3</sub> )	1.156	0.933	21.1	0.980	22.9	0.716	38.0	0.607	46.1	0.539	53.5
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>1</sub> )	1.347	1.198	10.3	0.976	26.0	0.879	33.3	0.824	37.5	0.763	42.2
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>2</sub> )	1.732	0.949	45.2	0.773	55.3	0.768	55.6	0.762	56.0	0.680	60.7
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>3</sub> )	1.744	1.655	5.1	1.623	6.9	1.359	21.9	1.115	35.2	0.866	49.9
<i>B. megaterium</i> (Bm)	1.558	1.455	6.9	1.117	28.3	0.591	61.0	0.261	71.2	0.248	77.5
<i>P. fluorescens</i> (Pf <sub>1</sub> )	1.133	0.936	17.3	0.887	21.8	0.809	28.6	0.421	41.3	0.376	66.8
<i>P. fluorescens</i> (Pf <sub>2</sub> )	1.415	1.043	25.3	0.785	43.8	0.758	45.4	0.725	47.8	0.366	73.9
L.S.D. <sub>-0.05</sub>	Isolates (I)			Concentrations (C)			I x C				
	0.052			0.042			0.126				

Table 3: Inhibitor effect of metalaxyl M + mancozeb against *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* isolates *in vitro*.

Bacterial growth as optical density(OD) and reduction (%)											
-----											
Metalaxyl M + mancozeb concentrations (ppm)											
-----											
	0.0	25	50	100	200	400					
	OD	OD	Red.	OD	Red.	OD	Red.	OD	Red.	OD	Red.
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>1</sub> )	1.640	1.602	2.3	1.489	9.2	1.210	26.3	1.176	28.2	0.590	64.0
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>2</sub> )	1.773	1.670	5.8	1.346	13.0	1.503	17.8	1.180	33.4	1.110	37.3
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>3</sub> )	1.156	1.132	4.9	1.069	7.8	0.947	17.9	0.916	19.6	0.827	28.4
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>1</sub> )	1.347	1.205	9.5	1.147	13.4	1.035	23.5	0.849	35.3	0.747	42.9
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>2</sub> )	1.732	1.576	9.0	1.118	35.9	0.971	44.0	0.830	52.1	0.749	56.8
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>3</sub> )	1.744	1.741	0.1	1.707	2.1	1.475	14.7	1.368	21.3	1.026	40.2
<i>B. megaterium</i> (Bm)	1.558	1.540	1.1	1.489	4.5	1.433	8.2	0.761	51.2	0.582	62.6
<i>P. fluorescens</i> (Pf <sub>1</sub> )	1.133	1.083	4.4	0.914	19.3	0.868	23.5	0.799	29.5	0.791	30.2
<i>P. fluorescens</i> (Pf <sub>2</sub> )	1.415	1.242	12.2	0.935	32.5	0.905	34.7	0.836	39.8	0.775	44.5
L.S.D. <sub>-0.05</sub>	Isolates (I)			Concentrations (C)			I x C				
	0.053			0.043			0.129				

Table 4: Inhibitor effect of penicycuron against *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* isolates *in vitro*.

Bacterial growth as optical density(OD) and reduction (%)											
-----											
Penicycuron concentrations (ppm)											
-----											
	0.0	25	50	100	200	400					
	OD	OD	Red.	OD	Red.	OD	Red.	OD	Red.	OD	Red.
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>1</sub> )	1.640	1.293	21.1	1.088	33.6	0.983	40.0	0.898	45.2	0.668	59.3
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>2</sub> )	1.773	1.409	20.5	0.959	46.0	0.860	51.4	0.756	57.4	0.675	62.0
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>3</sub> )	1.156	1.128	2.4	1.055	8.9	1.000	13.3	0.674	41.5	0.423	63.3
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>1</sub> )	1.347	1.239	7.1	0.912	30.8	0.858	35.1	0.738	44.0	0.667	49.2
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>2</sub> )	1.732	1.642	5.2	1.128	34.9	1.021	41.0	0.568	67.2	0.533	59.2
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>3</sub> )	1.744	1.717	1.6	1.679	3.7	1.613	7.0	1.287	26.8	0.941	45.5
<i>B. megaterium</i> (Bm)	1.558	1.425	8.5	1.175	24.6	0.960	36.5	0.861	44.8	0.672	57.0
<i>P. fluorescens</i> (Pf <sub>1</sub> )	1.133	1.083	4.4	0.956	15.7	0.901	23.2	0.750	33.8	0.631	44.8
<i>P. fluorescens</i> (Pf <sub>2</sub> )	1.415	1.369	4.1	1.319	7.4	1.288	9.0	1.044	24.9	0.861	38.3
L.S.D. <sub>-0.05</sub>	Isolates (I)			Concentrations (C)			I x C				
	0.074			0.060			0.180				

Table 5: Inhibitor effect of thiophanate-methyl against *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* isolates *in vitro*.

Bacterial growth as optical density (OD) and reduction (%)												
Thiophanate-methyl concentrations (ppm)												
	0.0		25		50		100		200		400	
Bacterial isolate	OD	Red.	OD	Red.	OD	Red.	OD	Red.	OD	Red.	OD	Red.
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>1</sub> )	1.640	33.8	1.084	36.0	1.049	36.0	0.858	47.5	0.655	60.1	0.570	65.2
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>2</sub> )	1.773	6.3	1.661	34.1	1.237	34.1	0.972	41.2	0.823	53.6	0.721	59.3
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>3</sub> )	1.156	4.3	1.100	15.7	0.957	15.7	0.956	17.3	0.761	42.6	0.628	45.6
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>1</sub> )	1.347	9.4	1.211	15.0	1.117	15.0	0.913	31.0	0.766	42.1	0.653	50.0
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>2</sub> )	1.732	36.0	1.109	48.3	0.895	48.3	0.861	50.3	0.826	52.3	0.730	57.9
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>3</sub> )	1.744	6.7	1.623	9.6	1.568	9.6	1.329	23.3	1.021	41.1	1.005	41.9
<i>B. megaterium</i> (Bm)	1.558	30.5	1.083	36.0	0.997	36.0	0.730	53.1	0.711	54.3	0.445	71.4
<i>P. fluorescens</i> (Pf <sub>1</sub> )	1.133	6.3	1.061	14.1	0.973	14.1	0.876	22.7	0.792	28.8	0.712	37.2
<i>P. fluorescens</i> (Pf <sub>2</sub> )	1.415	34.5	0.916	38.3	0.849	38.3	0.716	48.3	0.710	49.1	0.427	69.4
L.S.D. <sub>0.05</sub>	Isolates (I)				Concentrations (C)				I x C			
	0.078				0.064				0.191			

Table 6: Inhibitor effect of thiram + tolclofos-methyl against *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* isolates *in vitro*.

Bacterial growth as optical density (OD) and reduction (%)												
Thiram + tolclofos-methyl concentrations (ppm)												
	0.0		25		50		100		200		400	
Bacterial isolate	OD	Red.	OD	Red.	OD	Red.	OD	Red.	OD	Red.	OD	Red.
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>1</sub> )	1.640	18.9	1.330	60.6	0.646	60.6	0.439	73.2	0.200	89.6	0.162	90.0
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>2</sub> )	1.773	22.8	1.370	38.1	1.098	38.1	1.075	39.4	0.982	44.6	0.885	50.1
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>3</sub> )	1.156	1.0	1.144	2.2	1.130	2.2	1.024	11.2	0.907	21.4	0.821	28.9
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>1</sub> )	1.347	6.3	1.269	33.5	0.872	33.5	0.548	58.6	0.529	60.0	0.456	65.3
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>2</sub> )	1.732	35.6	1.115	41.0	1.022	41.0	0.685	60.4	0.542	68.7	0.445	74.3
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>3</sub> )	1.744	5.8	1.641	47.1	0.914	47.1	0.189	89.1	0.161	90.6	0.079	95.3
<i>B. megaterium</i> (Bm)	1.558	19.3	1.260	27.3	1.133	27.3	0.914	41.3	0.672	56.7	0.671	63.3
<i>P. fluorescens</i> (Pf <sub>1</sub> )	1.133	2.0	1.111	6.1	1.064	6.1	1.028	9.3	0.899	19.3	0.798	29.5
<i>P. fluorescens</i> (Pf <sub>2</sub> )	1.415	51.8	0.674	86.5	0.231	86.5	0.066	95.3	0.030	97.9	0.020	98.5
L.S.D. <sub>0.05</sub>	Isolates (I)				Concentrations (C)				I x C			
	0.050				0.041				0.123			

Table 7: Antagonistic activity of *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* isolates against the growth of some soil borne pathogens *in vitro*.

Mycelial growth (cm) and reduction (%)												
Bacterial isolate	<i>F. solani</i>		<i>F. oxysporum</i>		<i>R. solani</i>		<i>M. phaseolina</i>		<i>S. sclerotiorum</i>			
	Growth	Red.	Growth	Red.	Growth	Red.	Growth	Red.	Growth	Red.		
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>1</sub> )	3.9	56.7	1.8	80.0	6.2	30.0	2.0	65.6	2.7	70.0		
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>2</sub> )	6.6	26.7	6.5	27.8	7.0	22.2	3.1	65.6	3.0	66.7		
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>3</sub> )	6.3	30.0	4.2	53.3	7.6	15.6	4.1	54.4	2.4	73.3		
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>1</sub> )	6.6	26.7	7.1	21.1	7.9	12.2	2.8	68.9	2.6	71.1		
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>2</sub> )	4.6	48.9	3.0	66.7	2.5	72.2	3.6	60.0	2.1	76.7		
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>3</sub> )	4.1	54.4	7.3	18.9	8.0	11.1	3.8	57.9	3.1	65.6		
<i>B. megaterium</i> (Bm)	7.8	13.3	4.9	45.6	7.8	13.3	4.2	53.3	2.5	72.2		
<i>P. fluorescens</i> (Pf <sub>1</sub> )	7.1	21.1	6.9	23.3	7.5	16.7	5.0	44.4	1.1	87.8		
<i>P. fluorescens</i> (Pf <sub>2</sub> )	2.2	75.6	1.4	84.4	2.3	74.4	3.7	58.9	3.0	66.7		
Control	9.0	-	9.0	-	9.0	-	9.0	-	9.0	-		
L.S.D. <sub>0.05</sub>	Isolates (I)				Pathogens (P)				I x P			
	0.1				0.03				0.1			



Table 8: Antagonistic activity of *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* isolates in combination with pencycuron against the growth of some soil borne pathogens *in vitro*.

Treatment	Mycelial growth (cm) and reduction (%)									
	<i>F.solani</i>		<i>F. oxysporum</i>		<i>R. solani</i>		<i>M.phaseolina</i>		<i>S. sclerotiorum</i>	
	Growth	Red.	Growth	Red.	Growth	Red.	Growth	Red.	Growth	Red.
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>1</sub> ) + Pe	3.7	58.9	1.5	83.3	0.6	93.3	1.0	88.9	1.0	88.9
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>2</sub> ) + Pe	5.2	42.2	3.7	58.9	0.0	100	2.6	71.1	1.8	80.0
<i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>3</sub> ) + Pe	4.0	55.6	2.3	74.4	1.0	88.9	3.0	66.7	1.0	88.9
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>1</sub> ) + Pe	3.2	64.4	2.5	72.2	0.0	100	2.6	71.1	1.3	85.6
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>2</sub> ) + Pe	4.0	55.6	3.0	68.7	0.0	100	1.9	78.9	1.0	88.9
<i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>3</sub> ) + Pe	3.5	61.1	5.0	44.4	1.4	84.4	2.0	77.8	1.0	88.9
<i>B. megaterium</i> (Bm) + Pe	5.5	38.9	2.3	74.4	0.0	100	3.5	61.1	1.0	88.9
<i>P. fluorescens</i> (Pf <sub>1</sub> ) + Pe	5.5	38.9	3.5	61.1	0.0	100	2.7	70.0	0.0	100
<i>P. fluorescens</i> (Pf <sub>2</sub> ) + Pe	1.0	88.9	1.0	88.9	0.0	100	1.7	81.1	1.0	88.9
Pencycuron (Pe) at 25 ppm	9.0	0.0	9.0	0.0	9.0	0.0	9.0	0.0	9.0	0.0
L.S.D. <sub>0.05</sub>	Treatments (T)				Pathogens (P)			T x P		
	0.5				0.3			0.1		

Table 9: Effect of *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* isolates alone or in combination with pencycuron on the incidence of damping-off and root rot of bean plants grown under soil infestation with *F. solani* in pots.

Treatment	Pre- and post- emergence damping-off (%)		Root rot (%)	Survived plants (%)
	Pre-	Post-		
<i>F. solani</i> + <i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>2</sub> )	13.3	9.1	6.7	70.9
<i>F. solani</i> + <i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>3</sub> )	13.3	11.7	7.1	67.9
<i>F. solani</i> + <i>P. fluorescens</i> (Pf <sub>2</sub> )	0.0	6.7	7.7	85.6
<i>F. solani</i> + Bs <sub>3</sub> + Pe	6.7	7.7	4.7	80.9
<i>F. solani</i> + Bp <sub>3</sub> + Pe	6.7	7.1	3.6	82.6
<i>F. solani</i> + Pf <sub>2</sub> + Pe	0.0	5.7	0.0	94.3
<i>F. solani</i> + Pencycuron (Pe)	13.3	15.7	7.7	63.3
<i>F. solani</i> only	40.0	22.2	27.8	10.0
L.S.D. <sub>0.05</sub>	0.6	0.1	0.1	0.6

Table 10: Effect of *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* isolates alone or in combination with pencycuron on vegetative growth parameters of bean plants grown under soil infestation with *F. solani* in pots.

Treatment	Vegetative growth parameters				
	Shoot length (cm)	Root length (cm)	Leaves No./plant	Plant fresh weight (g)	Plant dry weight (g)
<i>F. solani</i> + <i>B. subtilis</i> (Bs <sub>3</sub> )	46.5	17.5	6.5	12.8	2.3
<i>F. solani</i> + <i>B. pumilus</i> (Bp <sub>3</sub> )	46.8	19.8	5.3	12.2	2.2
<i>F. solani</i> + <i>P. fluorescens</i> (Pf <sub>2</sub> )	52.0	21.8	5.8	17.1	3.2
<i>F. solani</i> + Bs <sub>3</sub> + Pe	51.0	22.5	6.8	13.4	3.4
<i>F. solani</i> + Bp <sub>3</sub> + Pe	46.8	22.5	7.8	13.6	3.7
<i>F. solani</i> + Pf <sub>2</sub> + Pe	52.2	23.5	6.5	20.8	4.0
<i>F. solani</i> + Pencycuron (Pe)	44.3	19.0	5.8	12.2	3.2
<i>F. solani</i> only	32.8	16.0	5.0	9.5	2.1
L.S.D. <sub>0.05</sub>	6.8	6.9	1.7	7.8	0.1

**Antagonistic Activity of Bacterial Isolates Alone or in Combination with Pencycuron at 25 ppm Against Some Soilborne Fungal Pathogens:** The tested bacterial isolates reduced the radial growth of *F. solani*, *F. oxysporum*, *R. solani*, *M. phaseolina* and *S. sclerotiorum* by the ranges of 13.3 -75.6; 18.9-88.9; 11.1-74.4; 44.4-88.9 and 65.6-87.8 %, respectively, when used alone. While the bacterial isolates reduced the same pathogens by the ranges of 38.9-88.9; 44.4-88.9; 84.4-100.0; 61.1-88.9 and 80.0-100.0%, respectively,

when used in combination with pencycuron at 25 ppm (Tables, 7 and 8). Although pencycuron at 25 ppm only did not showing reduction in linear growth of the tested fungi, but the growth appeared more weak than the growth in un-amended medium. Isolates of Pf<sub>2</sub>, Bs<sub>1</sub>, Bp<sub>3</sub>, Bp<sub>2</sub>, Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bs<sub>2</sub>, Bp<sub>1</sub>, Pf<sub>1</sub> and Bm, reduced the growth of *F. solani* by 75.6, 56.7, 54.4, 48.9, 30.0, 26.7, 26.7, 21.1 and 13.3%, when used alone, while the reduction attained to 88.9, 58.9, 61.1, 55.6, 42.2, 64.4, 38.9 and 38.9%, when used in combination with pencycuron,

respectively. Furthermore, isolates of Pf<sub>2</sub>, Bs<sub>1</sub>, Bp<sub>2</sub>, Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bm, Bs<sub>2</sub>, Pf<sub>1</sub>, Bp<sub>1</sub> and Bp<sub>3</sub>, reduced the growth of *F. oxysporum* by 84.4, 80.0, 66.7, 53.3, 45.6, 27.8, 23.3, 21.1 and 18.9%, when used alone, while the reduction reached to 88.9, 83.3, 68.7, 74.4, 74.4, 58.9, 61.1, 72.2 and 44.4%, when used in combination with pencycuron, respectively (Tables, 7 and 8).

In general antagonistic isolates of Pf<sub>2</sub>, Bp<sub>2</sub>, Bs<sub>1</sub>, Bs<sub>2</sub>, Pf<sub>1</sub>, Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bm, Bp<sub>1</sub> and Bp<sub>3</sub>, reduced the growth of *R. solani* by 74.4, 72.2, 30.0, 22.2, 16.7, 15.6, 13.3, 12.2 and 11.1%, when used alone, while the reduction attained to 100, 100, 93.3, 100, 100, 88.9, 100, 100 and 100%, when used in combination with pencycuron, respectively. Isolates of Bp<sub>1</sub>, Bs<sub>1</sub>, Bs<sub>2</sub>, Bp<sub>2</sub>, Pf<sub>2</sub>, Bp<sub>3</sub>, Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bm and Pf<sub>1</sub>, reduced the growth of *M. phaseolina* by 68.9, 65.6, 65.6, 60.0, 58.9, 57.9, 54.4, 53.3 and 44.4%, when used alone, while the reduction attained to 71.1, 88.9, 71.1, 78.9, 81.1, 77.8, 66.7, 61.1 and 70.0%, when used in combination with pencycuron, respectively. Isolates of Pf<sub>1</sub>, Bp<sub>2</sub>, Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bm, Bp<sub>1</sub>, Bs<sub>1</sub>, Bs<sub>2</sub>, Pf<sub>2</sub> and Bp<sub>3</sub>, reduced the growth of *S. sclerotiorum* by 87.8, 76.7, 73.3, 72.2, 71.1, 70.0, 66.7, 66.7 and 65.6%, when used alone, while the reduction reached to 100, 88.9, 88.9, 88.9, 85.6, 88.9, 80.0, 88.9 and 88.9%, when used in combination with pencycuron, respectively (Tables, 7 and 8).

**Greenhouse Experiment:** Soil application with each of Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bp<sub>3</sub> and Pf<sub>2</sub> isolates, reduced the incidence of pre- and post-emergence damping-off incited by *F. solani* by 66.75 and 59.0; 66.75 and 47.3% and 100 and 69.8%, when used alone, while the reduction reached to 83.25 and 65.3; 83.25 and 68.0 and 100 and 74.3 %, when combined with pencycuron seeds dressing at 1.0g/kg, respectively (Table, 9). The root rot incidence was also highly restricted in combined treatments than individual one. *Pseudomans fluorescens* (Pf<sub>2</sub>) proved to be the most effective isolate followed by *B. subtilis* (Bs<sub>3</sub>) and *B. pumilus* (Bp<sub>3</sub>) isolates. The treatment receiving Pf<sub>2</sub> isolates (soil application) plus pencycuron (seeds dressing) recorded the maximum plant survival of 94.3 %, while (Bs<sub>3</sub>) + pencycuron and (Bp<sub>3</sub>) + pencycuron recorded plant survival of 80.9 and 82.6, respectively, compared to 10.0% survived plants in the control (Table, 9). Other treatments showed moderate effect.

On the other hand, data presented in Table (10) show the effect of soil application with each of Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bp<sub>3</sub> and Pf<sub>2</sub> isolates alone or in combination with pencycuron seeds dressing on bean vegetative growth. Results reveal that the shoots length (cm), root length (cm), number of leaves per plant, fresh and dry weight (g) / plant of bean plants

were in the range of 46.5 to 52.0 cm, 17.5 to 23.5 cm, 5.3 to 7.8, 12.2 to 20.0 g and 2.2 to 4.0g in biological treatments alone or in combination with pencycuron, compared to 44.3 and 32.8 cm, 19.9 and 16.0 cm, 5.8 to 5.0, 12.2 and 9.5 g and 3.2 and 2.1 g in the treatments of pencycuron alone and control (infested soil with *F. solani* only), respectively.

## DISCUSSION

In the present study, according to OD values, bacterial isolates belongs to *Bacillus* and *Pseudomonas* genera viz., Bs<sub>1</sub>, Bs<sub>2</sub>, Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bp<sub>1</sub>, Bp<sub>2</sub>, Bp<sub>3</sub>, Bm, Pf<sub>1</sub> and Pf<sub>2</sub>, were highly tolerance to the five tested fungicides viz., mancozeb, metalaxyl M + mancozeb, pencycuron, thiophanate-methyl and thiram + tolclofos-methyl, at 25, 50 and 100 ppm and they were slightly tolerance at 200 and 400 ppm. This may be due to the reason that, some bacteria can use pesticides as nutrients and hence can tolerate chemicals [29, 30, 4]. The isolates Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bp<sub>3</sub> and Pf<sub>2</sub> found to be more tolerance than other isolates. This is may be due to the genetic differences between isolates to their response to the fungicides. The obtained data are in agreement with those obtained by Mohiddin and Khan [7]. They reported that *P. fluorescens* was found to be more tolerance to fungicides than *B. subtilis* and the maximum tolerance concentration for the former being 2500 µg/ml of thiram, 1600 µg/ml of mancozeb and 50,000 µg/ml for captan and carbendazim. The present study also reveal that the bacterial isolates in combination with pencycuron highly reduced the growth of *F. solani*, *F. oxysporum*, *R. solani*, *M. phaseolina* and *S. sclerotium* than bacterial isolates alone *in vitro* tests. This is may be due to the synergistic effects between the bacterial isolates and the fungicide pencycuron at 25 ppm. The fungicide pencycuron suppress the growth of the pathogens and make the hyphae more weak to be easily attacked with the bacterial isolates. The obtained results are in accordance with several workers [31-33].

Under greenhouse conditions, chemical, biological and integrated approaches to damping off and root rot control of bean were compared. The values of each Bs<sub>3</sub>, Bp<sub>3</sub> and Pf<sub>2</sub> isolates for damping-off and root rot incidence control was evident under artificial soil infestation with *F. solani*. However, it is clearly demonstrated that, *F. solani* pathogen can be successfully managed by combined application of bacterial biocontrol agents with a fungicide pencycuron used at low dose more than those obtained by a single application. The Pf<sub>2</sub> proved to be the most effective isolate in controlling the tested diseases

followed by Bs<sub>3</sub> and Bp<sub>3</sub> isolates. The synergistic effects between the bacterial isolates and the fungicide pencycuron at the low dose are involved. Soil infestation with bacterial isolates before sowing reduced the inoculum potential of *F. solani* pathogen. Although pencycuron seed dressing protect bean seeds from infection during emerge stage. The tolerance of bacterial isolates to the fungicide allow them to grow well and protect the tap and the lateral roots from further infection at any stage of plant development. The obtained results are in harmony with those recorded by [31,32,34,35,33,7]. The potentiality of *B. subtilis*; *B. pumilus* and *P. fluorescens* as biocontrol agents of phytopathogenic fungi in several crops is well known especially to *Fusarium* spp. [36-39]. There are many mechanisms suggested to clarify the role of antagonistic organisms in suppression of the growth pathogens and thus to control diseases. Their action could be through (i) mycoparasitism, (ii) production of antibiotic-type secondary metabolites and (iii) competition for nutrients and space. However, the bacterial isolates only showed the (ii) and (iii) mechanisms that can inhibit the growth of pathogens [38]. The increase of bean vegetative growth obtained in this study could be related to the effect of *B. subtilis*; *B. pumilus* and *P. fluorescens* as plant growth promoters [40]. The present results lead to strategy for the improvement of bean damping-off and root rot control. It also could be an important means to maintain sustainable bean productivity as well as reduced the amount of chemical fungicide need for seed treatment. Further studies to explore the interaction between bacterial biocontrol agents and fungicides in field experiment are desirable.

## REFERENCES

1. Rehman, S.U., R. Lawrence, E.J. Kumar and Z.A. Badri, 2012. Comparative efficacy of *Trichoderma viride*, *T. harzianum* and carbendazim against damping-off disease of cauliflower caused by *Rhizoctonia solani* Kuehn. *J. Biopest.*, 5(1): 23-27.
2. Malathi, P., R. Viswanathan, P. Padmanaban, D. Mohanraj and A.R. Sunder, 2002. Compatibility of biocontrol agents with fungicides against red rot disease of sugarcane. *Sugar Tech.*, 4(3-4): 131-136.
3. Archana, S., H. Manjunath, T.P. Ranjitham, K. Prabakar, T. Raguchander, 2012. Compatibility of azoxystrobin 23 SC with biocontrol agents and insecticides. *Madras Agricultural Journal*, 99(4/6): 374-377.
4. Devi, P.A. and V. Prakasam, 2013. Compatibility nature of azoxystrobin 23 SC with *Pseudomonas fluorescens* and *Bacillus subtilis* on chilli plants. *World Journal of Agricultural Sciences*, 1(8): 258-264.
5. Pallavi, R.V., P. Nepolean, A. Balamurugan, R. Jayanthi, T. Beulah, and R. Premkumar, 2012. *In vitro* studies of biocontrol agents and fungicides tolerance against grey blight disease in tea. *Asian Pacific Journal of Tropical Biomedicine*, pp: S435-S438.
6. Valarmathi, P., S.K. Pareek, V. Priya, R. Rabindran, and G. Chandrasekar, 2013. Compatibility of copper hydroxide (Kocide 3000) with biocontrol agents. *Journal of Agriculture and Veterinary Science (IOSR-JAVS)*, 3(6): 28-31.
7. Mohiddin, F.A. and M.R. Khan, 2013. Tolerance of fungal and bacterial biocontrol agents to six pesticides commonly used in the control of soil borne plant pathogens. *Global Science Research Journals*, 1(1): 1-4.
8. Hall, R., 1994. *Compendium of Bean Diseases*. The American Phytopathological Society, St. Paul, MN, pp: 73.
9. Estevez de Jensen, C., R. Meronuck and J.A. Percich, 1999. Biocontrol of kidney bean root rot in Minnesota. *Phytopathology*, 89: S24 (Abstr.).
10. Estevez de Jensen, C., J.A. Percich and P.H. Graham, 2002. Integrated management strategies of bean root rot with *Bacillus subtilis* and *Rhizobium* in Minnesota. *Field Crops Research*, 74: 107-115.
11. Abdel-Kader, M.M., 1997. Field application of *Trichoderma harzianum* as biocide for control bean root rot disease. *Egypt. J. Phytopathol.*, 25: 19-25.
12. Johnson, L.F., E.A. Curi, J.H. Bond and H.A. Fribourg, 1960. *Methods for Studying Soil Microflora-Plant Disease Relationship*. 2nd Edition. Burgess Publishing Company, Minneapolis, M.N., pp: 119.
13. Dowson, W.J., 1957. *Plant Diseases Due to Bacteria*. Camb. Univ. Press, London, pp: 231.
14. Lelliott, R.A. and D.E. Stead, 1987. *Methods for the Diagnosis of Bacterial Diseases of Plants*. 1<sup>st</sup> Edn., Blackwell Scientific Publications, London, ISBN-10: 0632012331, pp: 216.
15. Krieg, N.R. and J.G. Holt, 1984. *Bergey's Manual of Systematic Bacteriology*, Vol.1., Williams and Wilkins, Blatimore, London, pp: 217.
16. Schmitz, H., 1930. Poisoned food technique. *Industrial and Engineering Chemistry Analyst*, 2: 361.

17. Borum, D.F. and J.B. Sinclair 1968. Evidence for systemic fungicides protection against *Rhizoctonia solani* with Vitavax in cotton seedlings. *Phytopathology*, 58: 976-980.
18. Vincent, J.M., 1947. Distortion of fungal hyphae in the presence of certain inhibitors. *Nature*, 159: 850-850.
19. ISI, 1964. Indian standard specification for diazinon emulsifiable concentrates. Indian Standard Institution, New Delhi. IS 3899: pp: 10.
20. Estrella, F.S., G.C. Vargas, M.J. Lopez, C. Capel and J. Moreno, 2007. Antagonistic activity of bacteria and fungi from horticultural compost against *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *melonis*. *Crop Prot.*, 26: 46-53.
21. Pandey, K.K., P.K. Pandey and J.P. Upadhyay, 2000. Selection of potential isolate of biocontrol agents based on biomass production, growth rate and antagonistic capability. *Vegetable Sci.*, 27: 194-196.
22. Bardia, P.K. and P.K. Rai, 2007. *In vitro* and field evaluation of biocontrol agents and fungicides against wilt of cumin caused by *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *cumini*. *Journal of Spices and Aromatic Crops*, 16(2): 88-92.
23. Abd-El-Khair, H., N.G. El-Gamal and G. Nadia, 2011. Effects of aqueous extracts of some plant species against *Fusarium solani* and *Rhizoctonia solani* in *Phaseolus vulgaris* plants. *Archives of Phytopathology and Plant Protection*, 44(1): 1-16.
24. Singleton, L., J. Mikhail, and C. Rush, 1992. *Methods for Research on Soilborne Phytopathogenic Fungi*. The Amer. Phytopathol. Society, St. Paul, Minn, USA, pp: 132.
25. Mosa, A.A., S.T. Shehata and S.M. Abdallah, 1997. Biocontrol of cucumber damping-off by fluorescent pseudomonades. *Egypt. J. Appl. Soc.*, 12: 268-286.
26. Abdel-Kader, M.M., N.S. El-Mougy, N.S. Nehal, M.D.E. Aly, S.M. Lashin and R.S. El-Mohamady, 2012. Soil drench with fungicides alternatives against root rot incidence of some vegetables under greenhouse conditions. *Inter. J. of Agric. and Forestry*, 2: 61-69.
27. Abdou, E.S., H.M. Abd-Alla and A.A. Galal, 2001. Survey of sesame root rot and wilt disease in Minia and their possible control by ascorbic and salicylic acids. *Assuit J. of Agric. Sci.*, 32(3): 135-152.
28. Steel, R.G.D. and T.H. Torrie, 1980. *Principles and Procedures of Statistics*. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company Inc., pp: 481.
29. Kishore, G.M. and G.S. Jacob, 1987. Degradation of glyphosate by *Pseudomonas* sp. PG2982 via a sarcosine intermediate. *Journal of Biological Chemistry*, 262: 12164-12168.
30. Aislabie, J. and L.G. Jones, 1995. A review of bacterial degradation of pesticides. *Austr. J. Soil. Res.*, 33: 925-942.
31. Duffy, B., 2000. Combination of penicycuron and *Pseudomonas fluorescens* strain 2-79 for integrated control of *Rhizoctonia* root rot and take-all of spring wheat. *Crop Protect.*, 19: 21-25.
32. Frances, J., P. Vilardell, A. Bonaterra, E. Badosa and E. Mantesinos, 2002. Combination of *Pseudomonas fluorescens* EPS288 and reduced fungicide dose for control of *Penicillium* rot during post harvest storage of pear. *Acta Hort.*, 596: 883-886.
33. Omar, I., T.M. O'Neill and S. Rossall, 2006. Biological control of *Fusarium* crown and root rot of tomato with antagonistic bacteria and integrated control when combined with the fungicide carbendazim. *Plant Pathol.*, 55: 92-99.
34. Buck, J.W., 2004. Combination of fungicides with phylloplane yeasts for improved control of *Botrytis cinerea* on geranium seedlings. *Phytopathology*, 94: 196-202.
35. Kishore, G.K., S. Pande and A.R. Podile, 2005. Management of late leaf spot of groundnut with chlorothalonil-tolerant isolates of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *Plant Pathol.*, 54: 401-408.
36. Kim, H.S., J. Park, S.W. Choi, K.H. Choi, G.P. Lee, S.J. Ban, C.H. Lee, and C.S. Kim, 2003. Isolation and characterization of *Bacillus* strains for biological control. *The Journal of Microbiology*, 41(3): 196-201.
37. Hasan, S., G. Gupta, S. Anand, A. Chaturvedi and H. Kaur, 2013. Biopotential of microbial antagonists against soilborne fungal plant pathogens. *International Journal of Agriculture and Food Science Technology (IJAFST)*, 4(2): 37-39.
38. Sivanantham, T., V. Rasaiyah, N. Satkunanathan and A.C. Thavaranjit, 2013. *In vitro* screening of antagonistic effect of soil borne bacteria on some selected phytopathogenic fungi. *Archives of Applied Science Research*, 5(1): 1-4.
39. Vanitha, S. and R. Ramjegathesh, 2014. Biocontrol potential of *Pseudomonas fluorescens* against coleus root rot disease. *J. Plant Pathol. Microb.*, 5: 216 doi:10.4172/2157-7471.1000216.
40. Dalal, J. and N. Kulkarni, 2013. Antagonistic and plant growth promoting potentials of indigenous endophytic bacteria of soybean (*Glycine max* (L) Merrill). *Current Research in Microbiology and Biotechnology*, 1(2): 62-69.